

# WATER WORKS INVESTIGATION.

## The Hitherto Mythical McDonald Produced at Last.

### His Little Arrangement With George Lord.

### About That Brick Conduit.

#### AFTERNOON SESSION.

C. T. Amsden sworn—Am Secretary of the Board of Water Commissioners for the city of Rochester; in the Engineering Department the expense up to July 1st has been \$77,221.63; mainly for salaries of engineers and assistants; the Water Commissioners have received \$14,795; Consulting Engineer Quintly has received \$1,300, included in the sum given above; the Secretary has received \$4,229.17; that runs from two years ago in July; Jerome Keyes, for obtaining right of way, has been paid \$3 per day and \$2 for use of his horse; the allowance to the Commissioners is \$5 per diem for not more than two hundred days in the year; since January 1st the Chief Engineer receives \$5,000 per year; before that it was \$2,500; Assistant Engineer Jerome Keyes gets \$300 per month; Knichling, \$200 per month; Nichols, \$2,000 per year; Clarkson, draughtsman, \$3.50 per day; another assistant, \$2.75 per day; Cornell, inspector, \$2.75 per day; Northway, inspector, \$4.00 per day, and Halleck \$3.00 per day; Webster received \$3.00 per day, now discharged; Hotchkiss, \$2.25 per day; Amstead, \$2.25 per day; Fly, assistant, \$2.20 per day; Jones, inspecting wrought iron pipe, \$1,200 per year; Harris, clerk, \$1,500 per year; messenger boy \$15 per month; McMaster, inspector at N. J. foundry, \$5 per day; Purcell, \$3 per day; McKay, \$1,200 per year; McMahon, \$3 per day; Gilbert & Smith, engineers at Holly Water Works, each \$100 per month; two firemen, each \$50 per month; all my accounts in books; the particular credits carried out are from the itemized accounts in my books; vouchers would be the easiest method of showing correctness of the record; there is a voucher for each item paid; cannot tell from my records the exact cost of pipe for Holly works; the engineer can tell better; can tell you what I paid for it, though. [Witness produced his books]. August 14 1873, \$8,470 for 121 tons, at \$70 per ton; September 6, '73, \$25,130 for 359 tons; October 1st, \$9,100 for 130 tons; October 11th, 237 tons, \$27,000; November 19th, '73, 5,260 tons, \$368,300; July 11th, 1,382 tons, \$96,840; September 12th, 1,023 tons, \$71,610; October 10th, 910 tons \$63,700; November 14th, 880 tons, \$64,080; December 12th, 1,262 tons, \$82,000; April 17th, \$21,350; May 8th, 854 tons, \$24,789; total 15,968 tons received, and money paid \$1,117,760, all of which has been recd. to B. G. Clark; McDonald has been paid his \$6 per ton; can't tell how much was paid \$80 per ton for; the engineer can tell, I think, the exact cost of the Holly pipe; can't give amount for wrought iron pipe; the chief engineer makes the estimate and can tell you; there is nothing in my books to show rebate of interest on account of advance payment for pipe; there are none to my knowledge; can't report cash for extra work, for trenching or anything of that kind; the miscellaneous construction account debit balance \$1,948.72; in that is included all work not in the contracts, except the pipe, materials, &c., in the Holly works system; the crossing of the river and canals, Main street bridge, etc., are in it; real estate, \$95,219.77 general expenses, \$114,114.57; Holly system construction, 200,784.16; right of way, \$20,514.01; repairs and operating expenses, \$6,027.63; taxes on Rush reservoir, \$133.81; valves and hydrants, \$62,257.69; transportation of materials, \$939.35; engine house operating expenses, \$13,187.32; water services, \$29,305.97; office furniture, \$893.03; balance against Holly company, \$24.68; account R. D. Wood & Co., \$600; water metres, \$134. In the general expense account comes nearly \$80,000 for negotiating bonds, printing, etc., salaries of all employees not in engineering account and Commissioners; as appears from a page in my ledger, the Holly system construction account, save the pipe, is as I gave it. [Mr. Amsden then went through the various amounts given by him above, explaining them in particular.] All the payments have been made on vouchers, duplicate vouchers are on file in my office and with the City Treasurer; I prepared them myself; do not know of any payment made to any commissioner or to any of their employees for any contracts or work done; know of no promise to pay or any expectation; know of nothing that has not not been done in good faith and on the square.

By Mr. Merriman:—I know that the salaries of the Commissioners was only \$1,000 a year; supposed they served for honor, but they get very little of it; Mr. Bowman gets pay for actual service.

George W. Crouch, sworn:—Reside in this city; am a member of G. W. & C. T. Crouch, and also of the firm of Craig & Crouch; the firm of G. W. & C. T. Crouch have furnished James McDonald, through George D. Lord, lumber; the first dealing with him was something over a year ago; our contract was verbal; our price for oak was straights \$40 and in planks \$25; furnished 30,000 feet or more of oak; of pine wedges about 20,000; oak plank and lumber at \$40, probably 20,000; it was white oak; furnished also pine timber at \$28 and some at \$35 per thousand; that includes all our dealing with him; this was for water works; no one received from me any compensation or promise for furnishing this material; know of nothing else.

J. Nelson Tubbs, recalled: Can't give the exact amount of pipe in the Holly system without figuring it out; will do so and bring it in; the contract does not include the iron pipe but was paid for under the contract; all of the pipe for the Holly system was ordered before the panic of 1873; the order was given to B. G. Clark; There were 6,180 tons of distribution pipe laid and paid for at \$80 per ton; amounting to \$494,400; including the five per cent; 8,247 tons of conduit pipe at \$76—\$626,772; on hand 1,252 tons of distribution pipe estimated at \$75—\$93,900; 237 tons of conduit pipe on hand \$73.75 per ton—\$21,216.00; the total for cast iron pipe \$1,236,223.00, less five per cent, which makes paid for pipe \$1,174,412; there has been estimated 3,866,000 pounds of wrought iron pipe; there has been paid on that \$291,882; cast iron specials under second contract have been paid for to the amount of \$10,535, making \$304,417 paid under the second contract; for white oak 273,000 feet under first contract has been paid \$23,515; other lumber, 112,000 feet of pine at \$31—\$3,472, less five per cent; 274,110 lineal feet of trenching has been done in the city, for which has been paid \$164,454, less five per cent—\$156,260; this includes service; it may average smaller; the same price is paid per lineal foot; this makes somewhere from one-third to one-half a cubic yard.

#### MORNING SESSION.

John Fogarty, sworn—Reside in Rochester, on Lyell street; employed as foreman of laborers in trenching; the pay of laborers was ten shillings a day; they sometimes dug as high as thirty feet a day; I never dug but three or four service pipe trenches to the curb stone; the average of the trenching I did would not cost over 35c per lineal foot; I am now engaged in digging a sewer; have had no experience in digging trenches, except what I did here; the trenches dug by me cost as little, probably, as any in the city; others were harder to dig.

By Mr. Warner—The trenches dug by me for four inch pipe were five feet deep; I did dig some trenches for the double pipe near East avenue—about 300 feet; it was dug between eight and nine feet deep; that was near North street and East avenue; further up it was not so deep.

James M. Whitney, sworn—Reside in Rochester; am a mill owner, owning water rights; had negotiations with the Water Works Commissioners in regard to sale of water rights; I advised the construction of the water works building on the lower race. [The witness then detailed the water rights in which he had a share, and which he offered the Commissioners.] The mill building which I owned would have answered the same purpose as the new building the Commissioners erected; I think, indeed, the mill was better for the purpose; I was told the proposition was not accepted, because the other side was more suitable for their purpose; I offered them the two water rights for \$15,000; I know nothing more of account concerning these negotiations.

By Mr. Perry—I understand that they purchased three water rights with the property; I think they were worth \$17,000; I do not consider that we offered the New York mills for less than its value; and I think it is worth more than the property the Commissioners purchased.

Alex. W. Miller sworn.—Reside in East street; have been employed as foreman digging trenches in Center and Spring streets and Caledonia avenue; these were all for main pipes; have dug trenches for service pipe; dug for service pipe on Caledonia avenue, Edinburgh, Exchange, South St. Paul, and King streets, West avenue, Mansion and Grape streets; I should think I dug between one and two miles of main trenches; I think the average of one laborer a day would be about fifteen feet; we paid \$1.25 per day; I think they could do more back filling; I don't think the cost would be above twenty-five cents per lineal foot; I dug about two miles of service pipe trenches; they were four feet deep, to the pipe, and about 20 to 24 inches wide at the bottom; only perforated at such places as under the street railway track, instead of trenching.

By Mr. Filon—All the main pipes were laid 4 1/2 feet deep.

By Mr. Tubbs—I think it is possible that a man might have dug fifteen feet in a day, of main trench on Mill street; can't tell how much earth a laborer can remove in a day; some service trenches were dug for less than five or six cents; one was less than four cents; the most expensive cost about seven cents per foot; in my judgment a man can fill back about half as much again as he can take out, employed from 8 to 10 men on a service trench. [Mr. Tubbs here subjected witness to a sharp cross examination on the subject of the cost of digging service trenches.]

By Mr. Craig.—I kept an account on slips of paper for my own information.

By Mr. Tubbs.—I never made return to contractor, of the cost of the trenches.

#### THE McDONALD.

James McDonald, sworn—Reside in Essex county, Wellsboro Point; was a bidder on the water works, Hemlock Lake plan; had a conversation with Mr. Lord in reference to the matter before the bidding, in Albany; I told him I wanted to bid, and he said he wanted to bid too; we had a general interview; had no conversations as to the amount of our bids; we spoke of making an arrangement in case I got the bid; nothing was put into writing before the signing of the bid; I can't recollect how I sent my bid; I sent it about the time of the closing of the bid; remember making the as-

assignment of the contract to Mr. Lord; I don't recollect whether the agreement was made before the hearing, but it is my impression that it was made. I signed the assignment in Albany. I signed everything he had asked me to sign, and my communication with the Board or Mr. Tilden in regard to the bill, looking nothing over any time in Rochester, but Mr. Lord, either orally or in writing, gave me no objection and money for my doing so as a member of the Board, for any contract or privilege; gave me no objection of giving notice to the Board of the assignment of the contract; I might have spoken with Mr. Tilden or to Mr. Clark; I did state that I would leave Mr. Lord in charge, and that if Lord did not do it my right to sell as was I doing with a thousand barrels, and \$1, a thousand for freight, and Meyer Brothers for freighting in the city; I never suggested the brick contract would be built; we were told that it would not be built. I received two explanations by a parcel post, with the last number saying that the last number was told of the car pulling in 200 piles for freight (under contract). I didn't think a brick contract could be built there at any money; I was not an engineer, but my opinion is that a brick contract would not have been successful; I told him Mr. Lord thought the brick contract before making any bid; I thought it was a good point to take advantage; my experience in Charleston, Miss., concerning a brick contract there was something similar; I should think that a brick contract would have cost less, or might have given them more bargains; we said from his side of town, at least that is my impression; in such matters I am governed by the engineer; I thought more materials would be used than was stated for; I should not say that the something in the city as 50 cents per foot would not be maintained but in the same way as the 50c. in the city, and was; I should not be particular; I would think it would average about 50 cents per foot; I think there is not the system in operation in the country, as in the city; I don't make a guess as to the relative value of freighting in the city and country.

By Mr. Johnson—From over the ground upon the top of the ground where the brick contract was proposed, he has told me this tale, and the people from which I had in Albany.