The Burned-over District

THE SOCIAL AND INTELLECTUAL HISTORY

OF ENTHUSIASTIC RELIGION IN

WESTERN NEW YORK, 1800-1850

BY WHITNEY R. CROSS

West Virginia University

Cornell University Press

ITHACA, NEW YORK, 1950
BURNED-OVER DISTRICT was a name applied to a small region, during a limited period of history, to indicate a particular phase of development. It described the religious character of western New York during the first half of the nineteenth century. Time, subject, and area have thus all combined to confine the scope of this book. The study has nevertheless seemed rewarding, mainly because its implications transcend all three limitations.

The meaning expands in a geographical sense because this one area provides a case history in the westward transit of New England culture. Likewise, it is representative as a sample of the change from youth to maturity in a single section affected by continuing westward movement. The subject of religion has broader significance in this period and locality than might at first appear. This section was the storm center, and religious forces were the driving propellants of social movements important for the whole country in that generation. As far as time goes, this book is an illustration of the way in which the minds of one era help to form the destinies of succeeding generations. Neither the causes of the Civil War nor the origins of national prohibition, to cite only two prominent examples, can be thoroughly understood without reference to the Burned-over District.

Microcosmic study has definite advantages. This limited territory I have come to know intimately, perhaps thus achieving more careful analysis than I could have hoped for with a larger expanse. In
the small theater of investigation, integrated treatment of cultural, social, economic, political, and ideological causations may be more satisfactory than in larger ones. My motivation, in any case, has been no glorification of the locality, no devotion to regional patri­otics, and, most emphatically, no yen for antiquarian lore. Rather, I have tried by the microcosmic approach to produce a reliable and broadly meaningful bit of general American history.

My obligations in developing the volume are multitudinous. Professor Arthur J. May directed my attention to local history in my first excursion into the past of Rochester, New York. Dr. Blake McKelvey has more recently aided me in interpreting not only that city, on which he has written some of the ablest volumes of urban history, but also the whole of western New York. He has read and criticized the manuscript, entire. So also has Professor Louis Filler. Professors Arthur M. Schlesinger, Perry Miller, and Frederick Merk in courses at Harvard University greatly stimulated me to broaden my background for this work. Professor George H. Sabine and other officials at Cornell University were notably generous about time for research during my employment there, which was in a capacity that incidentally enabled me to travel extensively in, and greatly enrich my understanding of, western New York. Travels farther afield searching out sources brought rich acquaint­anceships and fertile suggestions from a number of experienced historian-collector-librarians. I am especially indebted to Dr. Lester J. Cappon, Dr. Randolph G. Adams, Dr. Thomas P. Martin, Dr. Clifford Shipton, Dr. Clarence S. Brigham, Dr. R. W. G. Vail, Mr. Edward C. Starr, and Mr. E. R. B. Willis.

Studies without which this one could not have been undertaken have been published by the late Dixon Ryan Fox, Robert S. Fletcher, the late Gilbert H. Barnes, Everett Dick, Dwight L. Dumond, John A. Krout, Charles Keller, David M. Ludlum, Paul D. Evans, Ralph V. Harlow, Lewis D. Stilwell, Fawn M. Brodie, and Robert F. Nichol. Their work merits recognition of my heavy obligation, beyond routine references to their books. Like all scholars in the period, I am basically indebted to Frederick Jackson Turner. In addition, I have profited from various suggestions made by President-Emeritus O. R. Jenks, Professor Glyndon Van Deusen, Dean Carl Wittke, Professors Richard Power, David Ellis,
and Neil McNall, the Rev. Frederick Kuhns, and Mrs. Edith Fox.

I wish also to acknowledge generous permission to use studies still in manuscript form by Professors Howard F. Bennett, Arthur E. Bestor, Jr., F. L. Bonner, Merrill E. Gaddis, Reuben E. E. Harkness, and Miss Christine Zeh. Miss Louise J. Hitchcock, Mr. Charles D. Osborne, and Mr. James A. Jackson have made accessible original manuscripts in their possession, and Miss Anna Hulett accorded me permission to use the Lewis Tappan manuscripts at the Library of Congress. The New York State Historical Association has allowed me to use material under its copyright that I originally contributed to New York History, and permission to quote from George W. Noyes, ed., John Humphrey Noyes: Putney Community (Oneida, N.Y., 1931), has been granted by the copyright owner.

Library and manuscript depository staffs have been universally courteous, patient, and helpful. The number forbids personal mention of my many benefactors at the following libraries:

Colleges and universities:—Aurora, Chicago, Colgate, Connecticut, Cornell, Dartmouth, Hamilton, Harvard, Michigan, Oberlin, Princeton, Rochester, St. Lawrence, Smith, Syracuse, Tufts, and Yale.


To three unfailing critics and advisers throughout a prolonged period, I owe my greatest debt. My mother, Helen Rogers Cross, and my mentor, Professor Arthur M. Schlesinger, have struggled to increase my literary skill, while inspiring my thinking constantly. My wife, Ruth Whipple Cross, has typed, criticized, and borne
more than a half share of all the burdens, direct and indirect, which the work imposed. These advisers merit the greater credit for whatever value the book possesses. Its shortcomings rise from limitations of mine which their efforts could not overcome.

Whitney R. Cross

West Virginia University, 1950
CONTENTS

Preface vii
List of Maps xiii

BOOK I. ORIGINS: 1800–1825
Chapter 1. The Great Revival 3
Chapter 2. Yankee Benevolence 14
Chapter 3. Premonitions 30

BOOK II. ENVIRONMENT: 1825–1850
Chapter 4. Canal Days 55
Chapter 5. Social Patterns 78

BOOK III. PORTENTS: 1825–1831
Chapter 6. The Martyr 113
Chapter 7. Yorker Benevolence 126
Chapter 8. The Prophet 138
Chapter 9. The Evangelist 151

BOOK IV. GENESIS OF ULTRAISM: 1826–1837
Chapter 10. New Measures 173
Chapter 11. New Men 185
Chapter 12. New Ideas 198

BOOK V. HARVEST: 1830–1845
Chapter 13. A Moral Reformation 211
Chapter 14. Perfect Sanctification 238
Chapter 15. Schism 252
Chapter 16. The Pattern of Dispersing Ultraism 268
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>The End of the World</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Utopia Now</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>World without End</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>The Passing Era</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>Notes on Maps</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF MAPS

I. Population Density in 1820 57
II. Population Growth between 1820 and 1835 58
III. Dollar Value of Manufactures, 1835 60
IV. Farm Area Served by Chief Canal Cities 61
V. Yankee Nativity 68
VI. Isms and Economic Maturity 77
VII. Home Manufactures, 1825 85
VIII. Home Manufactures, 1825–1845 86
IX. Common Schools, 1829 90
X. Common Schools, 1839 91
XI. Common Schools, 1829 94
XII. Common Schools, 1839 95
XIII. Private Education, 1845 96
XIV. Libraries 97
XV. Illiteracy, 1850 99
XVI. Illiteracy, 1840 100
XVII. Antimasonry, 1828 118
XVIII. Antimasonry, 1829 119
XIX. Early Branches of the Mormon Church 147
XX. The Finney Revivals, 1831 157
XXI. Liberty Party Poll, 1842 227
XXII. Antislavery in the Churches 228
XXIII. Adventism 289
XXIV. Fourierism 330
XXV. Spiritualism 350